

See discussions, stats, and author profiles for this publication at: <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/329261322>

Consumers' Perception and Frequency of Visit Before and After Wet Market Revitalization

Article in *Jurnal Bina Praja* · November 2018

DOI: 10.21787/jbp.10.2018.183-193

CITATIONS

2

READS

1,626

2 authors:



Arif Andri Wibowo

Universitas Jenderal Soedirman

9 PUBLICATIONS 8 CITATIONS

[SEE PROFILE](#)



Istiqomah Istiqomah

Universitas Jenderal Soedirman, Purwokerto, Indonesia

33 PUBLICATIONS 77 CITATIONS

[SEE PROFILE](#)

Some of the authors of this publication are also working on these related projects:



Local Economic Development Strategy [View project](#)



Entrepreneurship [View project](#)



CONSUMERS' PERCEPTION AND FREQUENCY OF VISIT BEFORE AND AFTER WET MARKET REVITALIZATION

Arif Andri Wibowo*, Istiqomah

Faculty of Economics and Business
Jenderal Soedirman University
Jalan Prof. Dr. HR Boenyamin 708, Purwokerto 53122

Received: 26 June 2018; Accepted: 20 September 2018; Published online: 13 November 2018

DOI: [10.21787/jbp.10.2018.183-193](https://doi.org/10.21787/jbp.10.2018.183-193)

Abstract

The Ministry of Trade revealed that there are 41 wet markets in 12 provinces in Indonesia suffering from damage, 50 percent of which are due to incomplete and inadequate market facilities. From a survey of 3,956 markets, 95 percent of them have a physical building over 25 years. In Banyumas regency there are two wet markets that have experienced the revitalization program, namely those in Cilongok and Sokaraja. However, this research focused on Cilongok market. This research aims to compare consumer assessment toward the level of cleanliness, safety, orderliness, and lighting, level of favorability and frequency of consumer visit to Cilongokwetmarket. This study used a comparative descriptive method to compare consumers' assessment. The before-after approach is used to assess the effectiveness of the treatment, characterized by an average difference before and after treatment. This research surveyed 100 respondents selected by accidental sampling. Data were collected by questionnaire-based exit interview. Data of the assessment pre-revitalization are obtained by recall method. Data were then analyzed using paired sample t-test. The results show that consumer assessment toward the level of cleanliness, safety, orderliness, and lighting of the Cilongokwet market after revitalization is higher than that before revitalization. Moreover, their level of favorability and frequency of visiting the market are higher, too. The results imply that revitalization of wet markets has been perceived positively by consumers, which has affected their frequency of shopping, thereby improving the competitiveness of the wet market against the modern market.

Keywords: Wet Market, Consumer Behavior, Revitalization, Consumer Perception

I. INTRODUCTION

Wet markets have contributed jobs and provided the life for many people. As an illustration, currently, in Indonesia,, there are 13,450 wet markets scattered throughout the country, which accommodate 12.6 million traders excluding suppliers of goods and market (Ika, 2016). The existence of a wet market has shifted because of the growth of the modern market and the internal problem of the wet market such as being messy, dirty, and uncontrolled. Therefore, it needs to revitalize the wet market to address the challenge (Fatmawati & Lantu, 2017).

Revitalization is a process, method, making reviving or revitalizing. The literal meaning of revitalization is to revive, but the meaning of the

word is not only to reorganize or reactivate what was previously there, but to refine its structure, mechanism of action, and adjust to new conditions, enthusiasm and commitment. The foregoing is in line with the Ministry of Trade's Wet Market Development Program, namely the Wet Market Revitalization. The program aims to support the development of wet markets based on proposals submitted by the regional government. It focused on the physical improvement of the market and the provision of training for managers and traders (Ika, 2016). Physical revitalization is carried out through the construction of new markets and renovations. Management revitalization is carried out by organizing market management training and market management assistance. The revitalized wet market is expected to be used as a model by

* Corresponding Author
Phone : +62 857 4377 5857
Email : andri15.aw@gmail.com

the regional government in the development of the wet market in the future so that the wet markets are able to compete with the modern markets and shopping centers.

The wet market revitalization program is an implementation of Act No. 7 of 2014 concerning Trade, article 13 paragraphs (1), (2) and (3) which mandate the Central Government to cooperate with the regional government to develop, empower and improve the quality of wet market management to improve competitiveness in the form of development and/or revitalization of the wet market, implementation of professional management, facilitation of access to the supply of quality goods and competitive prices; and facilitation of financing access to traders.

The market revitalization program has been able to increase customer visits, customer satisfaction and comfort, though the program still needs improvement. The revitalization program received a positive response from all stakeholders, including traders, consumers and market managers as a way to maintain the consistency and competitiveness of wet markets (Fatmawati & Lantu, 2017).

It should be emphasized that the transformation should not change the concept of the wet market into a modern market. The wet market must retain its function and role as one of the cultural heritages and uphold local wisdom where transactions between traders and buyers are not limited to the exchange of goods or financial transactions like those that occur in modern markets, but as a manifestation of social interaction through buying and selling transactions, bargaining between sellers and buyers in conditions that are made more comfortable, clean and safe. Thus, the concept of revitalization while maintaining the context of social revitalization in creating an environment that is interesting and has a positive impact and can improve the dynamics and social life of people/citizens (public realms). This identity will later be conveyed in the name of the "Wet Market" brand. Thus the market that displays the name/brand "Wet Market" on the information board, will be associated by the community as an SNI market (Puska Dagri BP2KP, 2015, p. 20).

The term "wet market" is used to indicate where local trade takes place, thus containing indigenous traits that have been going on for a very long time. The focal point of the wet market can be observed from its influence on the fulfillment of the livelihood of small communities. That is why the wet market can be a pillar of people's economy (Handayati, 2018, p. 491). The community is quite easy to reach the market location because it is attached to public transportation. In addition, the market location is

not located in areas prone to disasters, such as floods or landslides. As for the most prominent weakness factors, the existence of inadequate sanitation. The regional government of Pasuruan Regency needs to revitalize the wet market, which is the improvement (renovation) of the physical building of the market and is accompanied by institutional building such as developing organizational development of wet market managers and builders, including the development of market management system along with human resources involved and market traders (Handayati, 2018, p. 491).

Thirteen thousand four hundred and fifty (13,450) wet markets in Indonesia faced tight competitions from the entrants of modern markets. The wet markets failed to compete because of poor planning, inconvenient access, overcrowded trading activities, lack of air circulation and poor sanitation, affecting 12.625 million vendors. A more sustainable development model for Indonesian wet markets is proposed based on Singapore's sustainable commercial development. The Pasar Besar of Malang City, with 4,424 stores, 3,295 vendors and as one example of degrading markets, needed a new sustainable design. Therefore, an interesting architecture concept is proposed and hopefully could become an example of wet market revitalization in Indonesia.

The Wet Market Revitalization Program is one of the commitments of the Ministry of Trade of the Republic of Indonesia to improve the competitiveness of the wet market, improve the welfare of traders through increased turnover, support the logistics and distribution of material needs of the people and encourage the strengthening of the domestic market in an era of global competition. The location of wet market development or revitalization is prioritized for markets that are more than 25 years old, markets that experience fire disasters, post-natural disasters, and social conflicts, underdeveloped areas, borders, or regions with minimal trade facilities, and areas that have large trading potential. The financing mechanism for revitalization/development of the wet market is carried out through several funding channels sourced from the APBN and APBN-P of the Ministry of Trade of the Republic of Indonesia.

In order to realize this goal, the revitalization of the wet markets carried out by the Ministry of Trade of the Republic of Indonesia is not only in terms of physical improvement but also in terms of economic, social and cultural management. Through these breakthroughs, the government expects that the benefits of revitalization can be directly felt by the wider community, especially to support the regional economic base. Therefore, the wet markets that have been revitalized are expected to be modeled by

regional governments in the development of other wet markets in the future.

The aims and objectives of the revitalization or development of the wet market are: (1) to encourage the wet market to be more modern and able to compete with modern shopping centers and shops, so as to increase the wet market turnover; (2) to improve services and access to the consumer and at the same time making the wet market as a driver of the regional economy, (3) to realize wet markets with modern, cleaner, healthier, safer, fresh and comfortable management, so that it can become a permanent destination for consumer shopping destination and references in the development of other markets. The Indonesian Ministry of Trade's wet market revitalization program not only touches on improvements in terms of physical improvement but also in terms of economic, social and cultural management.

Wet markets are the economic basis of the people which have great potential and are able to drive the economy. In crisis conditions, wet markets are proven to be able to survive and be able to serve the needs and provide services to the wider community, both lower middle, and upper middle class. Wet markets have contributed jobs and provided the life for many people. Currently, in Indonesia, there are 13,450 wet markets scattered throughout the country that accommodate 12.6 million traders, excluding suppliers of goods and market managers. Therefore, the existence of wet markets which are now increasingly squeezed from the rapid growth of modern markets is important to be immediately rescued. One of the efforts is through the revitalization/wet market development program.

Ethnic and cultural factors handed down from generation to generation, as well as geographical factors, can have opposite effects. Communities with upper middle socioeconomic status can prefer to shop in the wet market compared to modern markets. The reason is simple, distance makes it easier to reach wet markets than modern markets that tend to be in the middle of the city. In addition, the products offered in the wet market tend to be more varied, fresh and more fulfilling daily household needs.

Gonzalez & Waley (2013, p. 3) stated that there needs to be a context for gentrification in the effort to modernize, repackage, and rebrand the wet market so that it can better meet the needs of its customers. Gentrification is an increase in the vitality of a region by improving the quality of the environment, facilities, and infrastructure within the area in order to improve economic conditions. According to Gonzalez & Waley (2013, p. 2). gentrification is

an effort to renovate and improvise the wet market by prioritizing three fields: (1) market renovation in terms of management structure, (2) grouping of community elements related to community market activities, and (3) efforts to promote the wet market as a shopping activity that can provide a unique experience accompanied by the provision of a clean and neat environment.

In the context of the wet market in Indonesia, the Center for Domestic Trade Policy (Ika, 2016), revitalization is measured based on the physical revitalization of buildings, revitalization of the economy (in its role to increase local economic growth), social revitalization (being a community element to actively participate in the process of market), and management revitalization (market management practices based on related legal measures). Good physical revitalization will ultimately have an impact on economic revitalization, where the market is more attractive to visitors, so that it will be able to create a perception that the wet market now has a good infrastructure (Gonzalez & Waley, 2013, p. 3), capable management, high quality and hygiene in the presentation of local food ingredients (Lagerkvist, Shikuku, Okello, Karanja, & Ackello-Ogutuu, 2015, p. 57), as well as supporting local economic growth.

The market revitalization program has had a positive influence on market management, the number of visitors, and merchant income. Market managers and traders adapt to a newer and more comfortable market atmosphere. The main problem in running this revitalization program is to change the mindset and trading behavior. Some traders still have limited knowledge about capital management, selling strategy, ways to satisfy customers, and traders often pay little attention to the cleanliness of their environment.

This study evaluates the impact of wet market revitalization on consumer perceptions about cleanliness, safety, orderliness and lighting, as well as the level of favorability and frequency of visits to the market. Wet markets are considered by consumers to have three typical characteristics. First, the atmosphere of the bargaining process of prices can establish personal and emotional closeness between sellers and buyers that cannot be obtained when shopping in the modern market. Second, traders in wet markets already know what the customer want. Third, wet markets are able to offer products that people want at an attractive price on goods not found in modern markets. The modern markets are rivals to wet markets because they are able to provide superior services to consumers compared to wet markets (Najib & Sosianika, 2017).

However, there are weaknesses in the wet market. The first is the negative image of the wet market due to the lack of discipline of traders and unprofessional market managers in implementing rules related to operational management of the market. Second, wet markets generally have poor designs including lack of supporting facilities, operational systems and unclear management procedures. Third, internal market problems such as poor market management, facilities and infrastructure, street vendors that reduce merchant's customers and lack of capital assistance available to wet traders (Agung, 2011, p. 14).

The rapid flow of modernization, one of which is characterized by the development of modern market brings fear that it may shift consumer preference from wet market to the modern market. The development of modern retail in Indonesia has been extraordinarily fast. In 2016 Indonesia was ranked 5th in the world of modern retail growth after China, India, Malaysia and Kazakhstan (A.T. Kearney in Coordinating Minister for the Economy, 2017). Citing USDA Gain report in 2013, the Coordinating Ministry for Economic Affairs further stated that the wet market share fell from 74.8 percent in 2002 to 55.8 percent in 2011.

The Ministry of Trade in *detikFinance* (2011) revealed that there are 41 wet markets in 12 provinces in Indonesia suffering from damage, 50 percent of which are due to incomplete and inadequate market facilities. The estimated number of wet markets in Indonesia is more than 13,450 with approximate number of merchants of 12,625 million people hiring 2-3 employees. From a survey of 3,956 markets, 95 percent of them have the physical building over 25 years. Therefore, during 2005-2011 the Ministry of Trade has revitalized 1336 markets with a total budget of IDR 1.69 trillion.

There are many contributions of wet markets to the local economy such as the availability of business opportunity, employment, and increased output. Therefore, in order to guarantee the sustainability of the wet market and to reduce the impact of the development of a modern market, it is necessary to revitalize wet markets. Wet market revitalization program is intended to change the wet market image of dirty, chaotic, smelly, and arid impression as well as less professional traders and market managers into a clean, orderly, comfortable, cool, and more competitive markets (Aria, 2014; Sipahutar, 2016, p. 30). In the development of such a policy, the participation of stakeholders is highly needed. According to Halik (2014, p. 93) there are 3 different roles of stakeholders including the recipients of information, decision makers, and providers of consideration.

The wet market in Cilongok sub-district is one of two wet markets that have been revitalized in Banyumas district. The revitalization program has spent IDR 3.7 billion sourced from the Ministry of Trade in 2013. The project started from 10 July to 6 December 2013. Before being revitalized, this market looks shabby, chaotic, and dirty because the drainage is often blocked, which disturbs consumers during shopping in the market. The revitalization of Cilongok wet market focused on physical building and market administration. The physical building of this wet market includes improvement of facilities such as parking lot, toilets and cementation of the floor, whereas the market administration includes an improved arrangement of traders of stalls and kiosks. According to the head of Cilongok wet market, prior to the revitalization there were 524 merchants; 366 of which owned Merchant Placement Letter (SPP) and 158 merchants did not have the letter. After the revitalization, there were 536 merchants, and all have got the letter. The number was reduced because before the revitalization, there were merchants who owned more than one stalls, which was no more allowed after revitalization.

With the revitalization, it is expected that there is a positive change of increased consumer visit. Therefore, this study aims to compare consumer assessment before and after revitalization which includes cleanliness, safety, orderliness, and lighting as well as level of favorability and to compare the frequency of consumer visits to that market.

The previous researches have focused on different aspects of the competition of wet market vis-a-vis the modern market. Zhang & Pan (2013, p. 497) explain the transformation of vegetable markets in China from the state monopolized system to a market-based system run by profit-driven factors. The transformation of urban vegetable retail shows both the advance that capital has made in re-shaping China's agrifood system and the constraints that China's socialist institutions impose on it. Shanghai's experience shows that the relative competitiveness of various retail formats is shaped by the state's intervention in building market infrastructure and institutions.

Huang, Tsai, & Chen (2015, p. 234) try to answer why wet markets still survive in Taiwan while facing fierce competition from western-style supermarkets. Adopting the perspectives of retail service, the results reveal that food quality and relational benefit positively affect consumers' satisfaction, and the effects of these increase with time; employee service has a positive effect on consumers' satisfaction, but the effect decreases with time; and the ambiance does affect consumer

satisfaction, but the store design does not.

Mele, Ng, & Chim (2015, p. 103) argue that in addition to their potential local economic impact, markets provide spaces for a variety of social exchanges and interactions that may strengthen communal ties, reproduce existing social tensions or simply reflect everyday diversity. Based on interviews, questionnaires and participant observation, their article examines social exchanges and interactions within wet markets in Singapore. The results reveal what types of social interactions found in wet markets are wide-ranging and informal, and occur across different ethnicities, generations, social statuses and classes; they can range from casual exchanges to planned gatherings to sustained relations based on mutual reciprocity and trust. Wet markets are significant to Singaporeans because they are spaces of unmediated social interactions because existing and meaningful social spaces are being erased by a redeveloped urban landscape, a concomitant disappearance of unregulated community space, and the pervasiveness of normative consumerism.

Gindi, Abdullah, Ismail, & Nawi (2016, p. 165) determine the shopping drivers that influence consumers to choose the night market or wet market for fresh fruit and vegetable purchases in Malaysia. By randomly selecting 700 respondents, they find that perceived freshness, perceived quality and perceived safety of the fresh fruits and vegetables are the most important shopping drivers in a consumer's decision to purchase FFV in the wet market.

Si, Scott, & McCordic (2018, p. 14), based on a survey of 1,210 households in Nanjing, China examines the purchasing frequency of various food items in different food retail outlets, the accessibility of these outlets and the use of different food sources. The study found that while supermarkets are the top venues for purchasing staple grains, dairy products and processed food, wet markets still prevail for purchasing fresh produce and meat.

Gorton, Sauer, & Supatpongkul (2009, p. 26), drawing on the Big Middle theory of retail evolution, an analysis of secondary and primary data on Thai shopping behavior seeks to understand the shift away from wet markets to supermarkets. The results show that on all salient attributes affecting retail outlet choice, supermarkets outperform wet markets. Even though wet markets continue to account for the majority of expenditure on fresh produce, their market share has declined sharply.

Using data from a market survey in Thailand and hedonic regressions, Schipmann & Qaim (2011, p. 15) analyze quality and prices for fresh vegetables from different retail outlets. Compared to wet

markets, modern retailers sell higher quality at higher prices, indicating that they primarily target better-off consumers, and not directly compete for the same market segments. Nevertheless, there are signs that modern and wet markets will converge gradually.

Hayate (2014, p.241) indicates that contribution to non-oil/gas GDP of the wet market is bigger than the modern market. However, the modern market, has a larger contribution to local government revenue. Wet markets, however, have an advantage in the provision of business opportunities, employment, and output contribution, even though they may conflict with local government interests to increase local revenues.

Based on case studies in Bandung City, Serang City, and Surabaya City with the qualitative descriptive approach, Sipahutar (2016, p. 27) finds that the factors inhibiting the competitiveness of wet market vis-a-vis modern stores are wet market's bad image and unprofessional sellers and managers. Paramita & Ayuningsasi (2013, p. 233) examine the effectiveness and impact of the revitalization program of Pasar Agung Peninjoan. With descriptive analysis technique and a Wilcoxon test, the result shows that the effectiveness of the wet market revitalization program is equal to 71.79 percent. This program has a positive and significant impact on the physical condition, governance and income of traders in Pasar Agung Peninjoan.

This study enriched the discussion regarding the competition of wet market vis-a-vis the modern market. Different from the previous researches, this study focused on whether consumers' assessment, favorability, and frequency of visit change after government intervention to revitalize the wet market. The same customers were asked to assess the wet market cleanliness, safety, orderliness and lighting before and after undergoing a revitalization program, and to compare whether there is a difference in their level of favorability and frequency of visit before and after revitalization. The results are therefore expected to provide an evaluation of whether the revitalization program can improve the wet market unfavorable image.

II. METHOD

This study used a comparative descriptive method to compare consumers' assessment on the wet market that experienced revitalization to find out the causality with the before-after approach. The before-after approach is used to assess the effectiveness of the treatment, characterized by an average difference before and after treatment (Widyanto, 2013, p. 45).

Primary data were collected in February 2015 with questionnaire-based exit interview to the consumers of Cilongok wet market. The wet market is located at the capital of Cilongok district in the western part of Banyumas regency. The assessment of research variables prior to revitalization wet was collected by the recall method. Direct interviews were done directly to consumers of Cilongok wet market after they finished shopping. The respondents in this study are those who purchase commodities for self-consumption, not for resale, and they should have been visited the market before the revitalization.

This research used survey method. Primary data were collected by questionnaire-based interview. Secondary data were obtained from the office of Cilongok wet market, The Agency of Industry and Trade of Banyumas Regency.

The population of this study consists of consumers who visited the wet market Cilongok District Cilongok Banyumas before and after revitalization because the purpose of this study is to compare consumer assessment. Because population size in this study cannot be determined, this study employed accidental sampling (Sugiyono, 2009, p. 56). This technique is a sampling technique to select respondents with whom the interviewer accidentally meets when observation is underway (Arikunto, 2013, p. 75). In determining the sample size, the following formula (Johnson & Mowry, 2012, p. 301) can be used:

$$n = \frac{z^2}{4(Moe)^2}$$

Where Z is the level of confidence, Moe is the margin of error or the maximum tolerable error, and n is the sample size. With a confidence level of 95 percent or $Z = 1.96$ and $Moe = 10$ percent (0.1), the sample size in this study is can be calculated as follows:

$$n = \frac{(1.92)^2}{4(0.1)^2} = 96.04$$

With a sample size of at least 96.04, the author decided to use 100 respondents. Cleanliness, safety, orderliness, lighting and level of favorability are assessed by using a 1-10 scale, with 1 being the smallest and 10 being the largest. The frequency of visit is assessed by how many times respondents shop in Cilongok wet market Cilongok in a month before and after the revitalization program.

Data were then analyzed by paired sample *t-test* with SPSS program to examine the difference in respondents' assessment on the cleanliness, safety, orderliness, lighting, level of favorability and frequency of visit before and after revitalization.

The paired sample *t-test* can be calculated with the following formula (Riduwan & Sunarto, 2014, p. 125):

$$t = \frac{\bar{X}_1 - \bar{X}_2}{\sqrt{\frac{(n_1 - 1)S_1^2 + (n_2 - 1)S_2^2}{n_1 + n_2 - 2} \left(\frac{1}{n_1} + \frac{1}{n_2} \right)}}$$

Where t is t statistic value, \bar{X}_1 is the average respondents' assessment before market revitalization, \bar{X}_2 is the average assessment aftermarket revitalization, S_1^2 is standard deviation before market revitalization, S_2^2 is standard deviation aftermarket revitalization, n_1 is sample size before market revitalization and n_2 is sample size aftermarket revitalization.

The analysis was used to evaluate the treatment in a particular sample in two different observation periods (Pramana, 2012, p. 47). This analysis is used to measure the effectiveness of the revitalization program from consumer perception and visit.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Description of Respondents

1) Age

Age of respondents ranges between 20-59 years old. The following Table 1 shows the distribution of respondents by age.

Table 1.
Distribution of Respondents by Age

| No | Age (years) | Frequency |
|--------------|-------------|------------|
| 1 | 20 – 29 | 7 |
| 2 | 30 – 39 | 32 |
| 3 | 40 – 49 | 39 |
| 4 | 50 – 59 | 22 |
| Total | | 100 |

Most respondents visiting Cilongok wet market are in the age group of 40-49 years old, followed by the age group of 30-39 years old. Respondents in these age groups are mostly housewives who shop in the market to buy vegetables and basic necessities.

2) Distance to Market

Access to Cilongok market is easy because it is located at the center of the district, so that many modes of public transportation are available such as bus, village public transportation and motorcycle. The cilongok wet market is mostly crowded by merchants and consumers every Manis day (there are 5 days in Javanese culture: Pon, Wage, Kliwon, Manis, and Pahing). This is due to the fact that Cilongok district is well-known as the center of palm sugar production; palm sugar producers get a payment every Manis day. Table 2 shows the distribution of respondents by the distance from home to the market. Distance to market is important because this study assessed the frequency of visit, which could be affected by distance.

Table 2.
Distribution of Respondents by Distance to Market

| No | Distance (km) | Frequency |
|--------------|---------------|------------|
| 1 | 0 – 0.9 | 19 |
| 2 | 1 – 1.9 | 10 |
| 3 | 2 – 2.9 | 36 |
| 4 | 3 – 3.9 | 26 |
| 5 | 4 – 4.9 | 9 |
| Total | | 100 |

Table 2 shows that the distance of respondent's distance to market ranges from close proximity to 4.9 km with the majority are consumers with a distance of 2-2.9 km. This shows that the distance which is relatively far from the market does not affect their visit to the market. That's because the Cilongok wet market is located in rural areas where many people, especially during Manis day spend the time to shop in the market.

3) Level of Education

There is a high diversity in respondent's education level, but low education dominates. The following table shows the distribution of respondents by education level.

Table 3.
Distribution of Respondents by Education Level

| No | Education Level | Frequency |
|--------------|--------------------------------|------------|
| 1 | Do not complete primary school | 16 |
| 2 | Primary school | 33 |
| 3 | Junior high school | 29 |
| 4 | Senior high school | 21 |
| 5 | Diploma | 0 |
| 6 | Strata 1 | 1 |
| Total | | 100 |

Table 3 shows that most of the respondents completed elementary school followed by Junior High School. It shows that in general, the respondents have a low education level. The distribution of respondents by education supports the finding of Gorton et al. (2009, p. 27) who found that the visitors of the wet market are dominated by low education level. This could due to the fact that the wet market is located in rural areas where most population have a low education level.

4) Type of Work

Table 4 shows that respondents are dominated by housewives. It is common in the study area that shopping is assigned to women. Cilongok sub-district is classified as a rural area where income level is low, and women typically work in agricultural production, so most households do not hire a housemaid. The following table shows the distribution of respondents by type of work.

Table 4.
Distribution of Respondents by Type of Work

| No | Type of Work | Frequency |
|--------------|---------------|------------|
| 1 | Housewife | 80 |
| 2 | Housemaid | 5 |
| 3 | Entrepreneur | 10 |
| 4 | Village staff | 3 |
| 5 | Civil servant | 2 |
| Total | | 100 |

B. Assessment of Respondents to Cilongok Wet Market Before and After Revitalization

Overall, the assessment of respondents to cleanliness, safety, orderliness, lighting, favorability, and frequency of visits to wet Cilongok market before and after revitalization has increased. The average assessment of respondents to these variables is shown in Table 5.

Table 5.
Average Score of Respondents Assessment to Cilongok Wet Market Before and After Revitalization

| Variables | Average score of respondent's assessment | |
|--------------|--|-------|
| | Before | After |
| Cleanliness | 5.95 | 7.91 |
| Safety | 5.90 | 7.04 |
| Orderliness | 6.16 | 7.14 |
| Lighting | 5.76 | 7.13 |
| Favorability | 6.26 | 7.56 |
| Visit | 3.99 | 4.19 |

Table 5 shows that the average respondent's assessment of the cleanliness, safety, regularity, lighting, favorability and frequency of visits to Cilongok wet market has increased. Based on the results of these studies several conclusions can be drawn as follows. Firstly, the average respondents' assessment of the wet market cleanliness increased after revitalization. The increase has seen the difference in the average score of 5.95 to 7.91. There are several things that cause such improvement after the revitalization, such as smoother drainage and more garbage trash available throughout the market. Secondly, the average respondent's assessment on the safety of Cilongok wet market increased after revitalization. It can be seen that there is an increase in the average score from 5.90 to 7.04. There are several things that affect the increase in the assessment, such as the provision of CCTV almost in many parts of the market that are considered prone to crime. It provides a sense of trust and comfort for respondents in shopping in the wet market. Thirdly, the average of respondent's evaluation on the orderliness of Cilongok wet market increased after revitalization. It can be seen that there is an increase in the average score from 6.16 to 7.14. There are several things that contribute to the increase in the assessment, such as after revitalization, all

merchants get a stall to sell their products, so that no merchant put merchandise in random. Therefore, it provides convenience for customers in shopping. Fourthly, the average of respondents' assessment of the lighting of Cilongok wet market after the revitalization has increased from an average score of 5.76 to 7.13. After revitalization, the market has been equipped with lamps throughout all parts of it. Lamps are very useful because the wet market has started activities in the early morning. Fifth, the respondent's favorability to the market has increased after revitalization. It can be seen from the average score of assessment that increased from 6.26 to 7.56. The reasons are among others, because respondents feel more comfortable and easy to find their needs in shopping. Sixth, the frequency of respondent visits to wet market of Cilongok has increased after revitalization. The average frequency of visit has increased from 3.99 to 4.19 in one month.

C. Consumer Assessment of Wet Market Cilongok to Cleanliness, Safety, Orderliness Lighting, Favorability and Frequency of Visit Before and After Revitalization

The difference of the cleanliness, safety, orderliness, lighting, favorability, and frequency of visit to Cilongokwet market before and after revitalization can be explained by using paired sample *t-test* (Sumarsono, 2006, p. 38). The results indicate that there is a significant difference in those variables before and after revitalization.

Table 6.
P-Value of the Difference of Cleanliness, Safety, Orderliness and Lighting Before and After Revitalization

| No | Variables | <i>P-Value</i> |
|----|-----------------------|----------------|
| 1 | Cleanliness | 0.000 |
| 2 | Safety | 0.000 |
| 3 | Orderliness | 0.000 |
| 4 | Lighting | 0.000 |
| 5 | Level of favorability | 0.000 |
| 6 | Frequency of visit | 0.000 |

D. Discussion

The revitalization program of Cilongok wet market implemented by the Ministry of Trade aims to enhance the competitiveness of wet markets from the competition against the modern market.

The advantages of the modern market will probably marginalize the wet market. According to Sipahutar (2016) to lift the image of wet markets it is necessary to improve the quality of infrastructure and quality of market management. The revitalization program of Cilongok wet market has spent IDR3.7 billion. Therefore, it is important to find out the impact of such program on consumers' attitude and behavior. The results of this study indicate that the respondents' assessment of cleanliness, safety, orderliness, and lighting of Cilongok wet market after revitalization is better than before revitalization. In addition, the wet market revitalization program also positively impacts the level of favorability and frequency of respondents' visits to the Cilongok wet market.

These results support the study of Paramita & Ayuningsasi (2013, p. 233) who found that the revitalization program of the wet market in Denpasar has a positive and significant impact on the physical condition and management leading to a higher frequency of consumer visit to the market and increased income of traders. The results of this study also support Dewi & Winarni (2013, p. 1) who indicated that the program of administrative office services, maintenance of hygiene infrastructure facilities, orderliness and market safety, optimization of land use and retribution management, and market development is of significant value for the development of wet markets, which finally result in increased favorability and frequency of consumer visits to wet market.

Despite the promising results of this research, it did not measure the impact of revitalization on merchants' income. Increased number of customers may not necessarily lead to higher merchants' income. Therefore, it is recommended to augment revitalization by incorporating institutional arrangements such as the establishment of cooperatives, standard operating procedures, and improved services.

Wet markets in Asian countries including Indonesia, still account for the majority of fresh meat, fish, and vegetable purchases (Yang & Monteiro, 2016, p. 7). Low-income groups generally prefer to shop in more crowded places, where many choices of necessities are available, prices are negotiable because sellers and buyers meet directly, at affordable prices, with cash payments, and where public transportation facilities are available; all are attributed to wet markets. Gorton et al. (2009, p. 3) identified that those shopping in the wet market more frequently are older and more characterized by lower income and educational attainment. Of the advantages of wet markets are high quality of fresh produce (Gorton et al., 2009) personalized

services, and convenience regarding the time of operation which is normally early morning on daily basis, thereby not disrupting working hours (Gindi et al., 2016, p. 165), and social interaction that range from casual exchanges to planned gatherings to sustained relations based on mutual reciprocity and trust (Huang et al., 2015, p. 234; Mele et al., 2015, p. 105; Yang & Monteiro, 2016, p. 1) revealed that food quality and relational benefit positively affect consumers' satisfaction (Huang et al., 2015).

Schipmann & Qaim (2011, p. 2) showed that supermarkets and hypermarkets sell vegetables at significantly higher prices than wet markets but offer higher quality, so they seem to target a middle and upper-income consumer segment. This seems like good news because low-income consumers may still constitute a relatively large group of customers in most developing countries. Yet this is a short-run perspective because over time the modern retail, by exploiting economies of scale, will be able to reduce prices and increasingly attract lower-income customers.

IV. CONCLUSION

This study concludes that the assessment of respondents to cleanliness, safety, orderliness, and lighting of wet markets Cilongok District Cilongok Banyumas has increased after revitalization. Furthermore, the respondents' favorability and frequency of visit are also higher after revitalization. This shows that the government initiative to revitalize the wet market has been perceived and responded positively by customers. Despite the positive effect of the revitalization program, the government should continuously take efforts to improve the competitiveness of wet market such as clear guidelines and standards relating to codes of conduct, staff training, hygiene and other service quality areas.

Despite the positive assessment of customers after revitalization, this study has a limitation as it did not ask the respondents which factors encouraged them to visit the wet market more frequently after revitalization, for example, whether it was due to more diverse commodities available at the market. This could be addressed by future studies.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The authors would like to thank the Head of Cilongok wet market for his support during data collection and to the editor and the anonymous referees for their invaluable comments.

V. REFERENCES

- Agung, I. D. M. (2011). Revitalisasi Pasar Tradisional: Masyarakat Harus Disadarkan Bahwa Berbelanja di Pasar Tradisional Bukan Berarti Kuno dan Antimodernisme. *Sewaka Dharma Edisi I*, pp. 14–17.
- Aria, P. (2014, March 13). Pemerintah Revitalisasi 461 Pasar Tradisional - Bisnis Tempo.co. Retrieved from <https://bisnis.tempo.co/read/561977/pemerintah-revitalisasi-461-pasar-tradisional>
- Arikunto, S. (2013). *Prosedur Penelitian: Suatu Pendekatan Praktik*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- detikFinance. (2011, July 5). 95% Pasar di Indonesia Sudah Berumur Seperempat Abad. Retrieved from <https://finance.detik.com/berita-ekonomi-bisnis/1674695/95-pasar-di-indonesia-sudah-berumur-seperempat-abad?>
- Dewi, U., & Winarni, F. (2013). Pengembangan Pasar Tradisional Menghadapi Gempuran Pasar Modern di Kota Yogyakarta. In *Proceeding Simposium Nasional Asian III*. Universitas 17 Agustus 1945 Semarang.
- Fatmawati, F., & Lantu, D. C. (2017). Evaluation of Revitalization Program (Case: Cihapit Traditional Market). *Journal of Business and Management*, 6(1), 101–113. Retrieved from <http://journal.sbm.itb.ac.id/index.php/jbm/article/view/2144>
- Gindi, A. A., Abdullah, A. M., Ismail, M. M., & Nawati, N. M. (2016). Shopping drivers of generational cohorts: A comparison between night market and wet market formats for fresh fruit and vegetable purchase in Malaysia. *Australasian Marketing Journal (AMJ)*, 24(2), 165–170. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.ausmj.2016.05.002>
- Gonzalez, S., & Waley, P. (2013). Traditional Retail Markets: The New Gentrification Frontier? *Antipode*, 45(4), 965–983. <http://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8330.2012.01040.x>
- Gorton, M., Sauer, J., & Supatponkul, P. (2009). Investigating Thai Shopping Behaviour: Wet-Markets, Supermarkets and Food Quality. In *The 83rd Annual Conference of the Agricultural Economics Society* (pp. 1–29). Dublin.
- Halik, A. (2014). Peran Pemerintah Kota Serang dalam Kebijakan Pengembangan Pasar Tradisional. *Jurnal Bina Praja*, 06(02), 84–100. <http://doi.org/10.21787/JBP.06.2014.84-100>
- Handayati, P. (2018). Developing Regional Market Based on Local Commodity: (Case Study on Regional Market in Pasuruan Regency). *KnE Social Sciences*, 3(3), 491. <http://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v3i3.1906>
- Haryotojo, B. (2014). Dampak Ekspansi Hypermarket terhadap Pasar Tradisional di Daerah. *Jurnal Bina Praja*, 06(03), 241–248. <http://doi.org/10.21787/JBP.06.2014.241-248>
- Huang, C., Tsai, K.-H., & Chen, Y.-C. (2015). How do wet markets still survive in Taiwan? *British Food Journal*, 117(1), 234–256. <http://doi.org/10.1108/BFJ-05-2013-0136>
- Ika, A. (2016, May 4). Mendag: Target Revitalisasi Pasar 2015 Tercapai - Kompas.com. Retrieved from <https://ekonomi.kompas.com/read/2016/05/04/190100526/Mendag.Target.Revitalisasi.Pasar.2015.Tercapai>
- Johnson, D. B., & Mowry, T. A. (2012). *Mathematics: A Practical Odyssey* (7th ed.). Cengage Learning.
- Lagerkvist, C. J., Shikuku, K., Okello, J., Karanja, N., & Ackello-Ogutu, C. (2015). A conceptual approach for measuring farmers' attitudes to integrated soil fertility management in Kenya. *NJAS - Wageningen Journal of Life Sciences*, 74–75(75), 17–26. <http://doi.org/10.1016/j.njas.2015.06.001>
- Mele, C., Ng, M., & Chim, M. B. (2015). Urban markets as a 'corrective' to advanced urbanism: The social space of wet markets in contemporary Singapore. *Urban Studies*, 52(1), 103–120. <http://doi.org/10.1177/0042098014524613>
- Najib, M. F., & Sosianika, A. (2017). Retail Service Quality in Indonesia: Traditional Market Vs. Modern Market. *Academy of Marketing Studies Journal*, 21(2). Retrieved from <https://www.abacademies.org/articles/retail-service-quality-in-indonesia-traditional-market-vs-modern-market-6763.html>
- Paramita, A. A. I. M. P., & Ayuningsasi, A. A. K. (2013). Efektivitas dan Dampak Program Revitalisasi Pasar Tradisional di Pasar Agung Peninjoan. *E-Jurnal Ekonomi Pembangunan*, 2(5), 233–243. Retrieved from <https://ojs.unud.ac.id/index.php/eep/issue/view/800>
- Pramana, H. W. (2012). *Aplikasi Inventory Berbasis Access 2003*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.
- Puska Dagri BP2KP. (2015). *Laporan Akhir Analisis Arah Pengembangan Pasar Rakyat*. Jakarta.
- Riduwan, & Sunarto, H. (2014). *Pengantar Statistika Pendidikan, Sosial, Ekonomi, Komunikasi, dan Bisnis*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Schipmann, C., & Qaim, M. (2011). Modern Food Retailers and Traditional Markets in Developing Countries: Comparing Quality, Prices, and Competition Strategies in Thailand. *Applied Economic Perspectives and Policy*, 33(3), 345–362. <http://doi.org/10.1093/aep/ppr018>
- Si, Z., Scott, S., & McCordic, C. (2018). Wet markets, supermarkets and alternative food sources: consumers' food access in Nanjing, China. *Canadian Journal of Development Studies /*

- Revue Canadienne d'études Du Développement*, 0(0), 1-19. <http://doi.org/10.1080/02255189.2018.1442322>
- Sipahutar, H. (2016). Factors Affecting Traditional Markets Competitiveness. *Jurnal Bina Praja*, 08(01), 27-38. <http://doi.org/10.21787/JBP.08.2016.27-38>
- Sugiyono. (2009). *Metode Penelitian Bisnis (Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D)*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Sumarsono, S. (2006). *Ekonomi Mikro: Teori dan Soal Latihan*. Yogyakarta: Graha Ilmu.
- Widyanto, M. A. (2013). *Statistika Terapan: Konsep & Aplikasi SPSS/LISEL dalam Penelitian Pendidikan, Psikologi & Ilmu Sosial Lainnya*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.
- Yang, S.-H., & Monteiro, D. S. (2016). What's in a Price? The Impact of Starting Point Bias in WTP for Information in Taiwanese Wet Markets. In *The Agricultural & Applied Economics Association's 2016 AAEA Annual Meeting*. Boston, MA: The Agricultural & Applied Economics Association.
- Zhang, Q. F., & Pan, Z. (2013). The Transformation of Urban Vegetable Retail in China: Wet Markets, Supermarkets and Informal Markets in Shanghai. *Journal of Contemporary Asia*, 43(3), 497-518. <http://doi.org/10.1080/00472336.2013.782224>